

Message

From: Greene, Nikia [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=32A08A414A4F40199B557C0819EB7D0B-GREENE, NIKIA]
Sent: 1/28/2013 2:15:12 PM
To: Vranka, Joe [vranka.joe@epa.gov]; Elsen, Henry [Elsen.Henry@epa.gov]; DalSoglio, Julie [DalSoglio.Julie@epa.gov]
Subject: Fw: Forward: Correspondence from Dan Powers

FYI

Nikia Greene
Remedial Project Manager
U.S. EPA Region 8
10 W. 15th St.; Suite 3200
Helena, MT 59626
Ph: 406-457-5019
Fax: 406-457-5056

----- Forwarded by Nikia Greene/MO/R8/USEPA/US on 01/28/2013 07:14 AM -----

From: Janet Cornish <janet@cdsofmontana.com>
To: Cord Harris <Cord.Harris@bp.com>, Dan Powers <dpowers@bsb.mt.gov>, Dan Strausbaugh/MO/R8/USEPA/US@EPA, Dina Johnson <DLJohnson@environcorp.com>, "helen.joyce@mse-ta.com" <helen.joyce@mse-ta.com>, Janet Cornish <janet@cdsofmontana.com>, "jcornish@pioneer-technical.com" <jcornish@pioneer-technical.com>, "Joe Griffin" <jgriffin@mt.gov>, "john.pullman@mercurystmed.com" <john.pullman@mercurystmed.com>, "kganesan@mtech.edu" <kganesan@mtech.edu>, Lisa DeWitt <lidewitt@mt.gov>, "mbenedict@mtech.edu" <mbenedict@mtech.edu>, Nikia Greene/MO/R8/USEPA/US@EPA, "rrossi@mtech.edu" <rrossi@mtech.edu>, Rosalind Schoof <rschoof@environcorp.com>, Sara Sparks/MO/R8/USEPA/US@EPA, "Shannon.holland@sjh-mt.org" <Shannon.holland@sjh-mt.org>, "scoe@mt.gov" <scoe@mt.gov>, Susan Griffin/R8/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 01/24/2013 05:54 PM
Subject: Forward: Correspondence from Dan Powers

Dan asked me to forward the following correspondence to all of you.

--Janet C.

Hi Janet,

Could you forward this to the entire group?

Thank you!!

-----Original Message-----

From: Stacie Barry [mailto:stacieb@ncat.org]
Sent: Thursday, January 24, 2013 1:39 PM
To: 'Peterson, Holly'; 'Fritz Daily'; Powers, Dan
Cc: bmcdonough@bresnan.net; 'Erik Nylund'; helen.joyce@mse-ta.com; 'Matthew Vincent'; Foley, Dan
Subject: RE: Health study Letter

I completely agree with each of Dr. Peterson's points. I can only hope the members on this routing list and on the study committee take the time to investigate each of her points. She is a highly educated expert in this matter and can back up each of these statements with a plethora of references. Lead is not the chief or only contaminant in the BPSOU or surrounding areas and it is both misleading to the public and unscientific to present a study of blood lead levels as a comprehensive health study or an indication of risk or toxic effects stemming from exposure to other contaminants. There has been absolutely no attempt to understand the chemicals as a mixture, either. This study is being done this way because EPA, ARCO, and their researcher believe that they already know the outcome of the study based on the results of blood lead studies done in recent years. This is the same reason they are willing to look at incidence rates. In my dissertation, I reported the lower incidence rates for Butte-Silver Bow versus the rest of the State. I found it amusing that they put this forward as new information after my study. I think there are several compounding reasons for the lower incidence rates, but that is another

topic for another day.

I have tried my best to stay out of this as well, because my previous involvement was a truly atrocious experience, but obviously care very deeply about the issue and am having a hard time remaining silent. I think it is truly incorrect and deceptive to present this current study to the public as anything other than a blood lead study and I think the public deserves to know if there are health issues in the community and if so, what can be done about them. There are several things, such as calcium supplementation, that could be promoted to prevent lead and other metal absorption, but instead of looking into this type of practical solution the powers that be are instead spending time and energy defending themselves and their previous actions. I, for one, am truly disappointed.

Sincerely,

Stacie Barry, PhD
Operations Director, Energy Services
National Center for Appropriate Technology(NCAT)
3040 Continental Drive, Butte MT 59701
(406) 533-6658

-----Original Message-----

From: Peterson, Holly [mailto:HPeterson@mtech.edu]
Sent: Thursday, January 24, 2013 11:59 AM
To: Fritz Daily; Powers, Dan
Cc: Stacie Barry; bmcdonough@bresnan.net; Erik Nylund; helen.joyce@mse-ta.com; Matthew Vincent; dfoley@bsb.mt.gov
Subject: RE: Health study Letter

To Whomever It Concerns:

I have been trying to stay out of this, but I will add a few other points to Mr. Daily's comments:

1. The study proposes to analyze some blood lead data. Blood lead is not "health." Thus, you should not call the proposed project a "health study."
2. The blood lead program in Butte has many deficiencies, but ARCO/EPA did not design the program to be a comprehensive or conservative marker of exposure in Butte. They chose a small subset of the population to test, some of whom (i.e., pregnant women) happened to show the lowest blood lead levels in the 1990 University of Cincinnati study (also funded by ARCO). Thus, the data will be biased towards lower concentrations.
3. The blood lead program has been very limited to whom is/was eligible for testing.
4. The blood lead data will not be sufficient to understand risks because the instrumentation used to analyze the samples had a detection level that was too high. (For example, recent medical research has shown behavioral and learning problems in children and young adults at much lower blood lead levels than the detection limit used in the Butte program.)
5. Lead is only one of the contaminants of concern in Butte. Arsenic exposure should also be a primary focus. While the EPA has publicly claimed to have years of urinary arsenic data, it is not true.
6. The consulting firm chosen to perform the study has been intimately involved with ARCO for many years. These people are not independent, third-party experts.

7. Samples of soil and dust in Butte have indicated that the contamination is not evenly-spread throughout Butte and Silver Bow County; thus, a comprehensive health study of disease rates, mortality rates, and other health-related problems on neighborhood scales is needed.

Sincerely,

Holly Peterson

3015 Ottawa

Butte, MT 59701

From: Fritz Daily [buttedaily@bresnan.net]
Sent: Wednesday, January 23, 2013 11:48 AM
To: Powers, Dan
Cc: Peterson, Holly; Stacie Barry; bmcdonough@bresnan.net; Erik Nylund; helen.joyce@mse-ta.com; Matthew Vincent; dfoley@bsb.mt.gov
Subject: Health study Letter

Dan,

Please include this letter in the official record addressing my concerns with the recent Health Study conducted by your office, Arco and the agencies.

Fritz

Previous Item Next Item
Connected to Microsoft Exchange

Janet

Janet A. Cornish, Owner and Principal
Community Development Services of Montana
954 Caledonia Street
Butte, MT 59701
406-723-7993
<http://cdsofmontana.com>